

**LIST OF DOCUMENTS IDENTIFIED BY Cabinet Ciolos FOR THE REQUEST OF ACCESS TO DOCUMENTS No Gestdem 2013/2361**

<i>No</i>	<i>Title/kind (email, note) of document</i>	<i>Author of document</i>	<i>Date of document</i>	<i>decision Give access</i>	<i>Comment or justification in case of refusal</i>
1	EFSA Report – letter	Bayer	30/01/2013	yes	
2	EFSA review – letter	Syngenta	21/11/2012	yes	
3	Intention of French Ministry of Agriculture - letter	Syngenta	04/06/2012	Yes	
4	5th forum for future of agricultre – letter	FFA	02/04/2012	Yes	
5	Invitation biotechnology event + reply-email	Europabio	01/02/2012	Yes	
6	Invitation 5th forum for future of agriculture - letter	Syngenta	16/02/2012	Yes	
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14					
15					

CABINET BORG					
HK		A	S		
		R	R		
30. 01. 2013					
COM	HoC	NB	RD	KS	SpK
HV	PDG	HK	JS	PM	ALL



1

Mr. Tonio Borg  
Commissioner for Health and Consumer Protection  
European Commission

B-1049 Brussels

**EFSA Report on the risks to bees from neonicotinoid pesticides**

January 30, 2013

Bayer AG

Dear Commissioner,

I am writing to you as we are highly concerned about the proposals your Directorate General has put up for discussion in a working document for tomorrow's Standing Committee (SCFCAH).

This discussion paper is neither proportionate nor based on scientific data or any new evidence.

During the last months we have been in close contact with your services and stakeholders to develop appropriate measures to mitigate potential risks to pollinators from the use of seed treatment products containing our neonicotinoid compounds.

We are taken totally by surprise to learn now that the Commission is proposing to suspend the use of ALL plant protection products containing our neonicotinoids (imidacloprid and clothianidin) for all uses and crops that were considered to be attractive to bees for at least 2 years, starting latest mid of this year. This goes far beyond the uses (seed treatment and granules) as assessed in the recent EFSA reports and as we've understood now includes also foliar applications, and home and garden uses.

Products containing these substances have been used very safely and efficiently for many years in the European agriculture and are desperately desired by EU farmers and even in non-professional horticulture and ornamental uses, as for many pests there are no adequate effective alternatives available anymore on the market. The European

[REDACTED]

Commission should also consider that following the revision of Directive 91/414 (resp. Regulation 1107/2009) EU farmers already lost a significant number of insecticides to control an increasing number of pests. This milestone in innovation forms the backbone of today's insect control in agriculture and horticulture.

Legislative actions based on the conclusions of the EFSA reports should include the reinforcement of risk mitigation measures and the extension of the monitoring work at the EU reference laboratories on bee health and on national level to provide sound data for further mitigation measures and research activities.

In addition, the proposed timelines do not leave any room for thorough and solid consideration of the impact these suspensions will have on agriculture, trade and the European economy as a whole.

We therefore urge you to adhere to the principles of proportionality when addressing the issue and refer back to solid science before taking any measures which would jeopardize the competitiveness and innovation of European agriculture and finally lead to higher costs for food, feed and fiber and enormous economic impact throughout the whole food chain.

Yours sincerely,  
Bayer AG

[Redacted signature block]

Cc: Antonio Tajani, Vice-President of the European Commission,  
responsible for Industry and Entrepreneurship  
Dacian Cioloș, Commissioner for Agriculture and Rural  
Development  
Karl De Gucht, Commissioner for Trade  
Maire Geoghegan-Quinn, European Commissioner for  
Research, Innovation and Science

2



[Redacted]

Tel. [Redacted]

Syngenta AG  
Werk Rosental  
Schwarzwaldallee 215  
CH-4058 Basel

www.syngenta.com

To: **Commissioner Máire Geoghegan-Quinn, European Commission**  
**Commissioner Dacian Cioloş, European Commission**

Wednesday, November 21, 2012

**Sustainable intensive agriculture – EFSA review on neonicotinoid risks to bee health**

Dear Commissioner Geoghegan-Quinn,  
Dear Commissioner Cioloş

Syngenta believes that insecticides, in particular neonicotinoid based seed treatments, are an *essential contributor to sustainable intensive agriculture and do not damage the health of bee populations*. They do however significantly reduce the load on the environment when compared to other pesticides as well as delivering significant socio-economic benefits.

Although several Member State Governments, reputable universities and experts across Europe share this view, there are a small number of vocal individuals and groups who continue to suggest the opposite. In recent years these groups have skillfully leveraged media reporting of individual *alarmist studies despite the fact that they are typically based on completely unrealistic dose rates and/ or the forced exposure of bees to the insecticides in question*.

In response, the Commission promised a comprehensive review of neonicotinoid based pesticides to fully understand their impact on bee populations. Given the importance of bees in agriculture, Syngenta supported this intention. However, the ability to carry out such a review was compromised by the need to publish the findings before the end of 2012. This put enormous pressure on EFSA and resulted in a number of key Member States refusing to support the process within these timescales.

As a consequence, the scope of the review was narrowed to just three of the five commercially available neonicotinoid based pesticides which happen to be the three currently used for seed treatment. This includes Syngenta's Thiamethoxam. The justification offered for this selection is that these three exhibit the higher level of acute toxicity. This criterion immediately makes the review "hazard based". This is exacerbated further by the fact that EFSA appears to be using its new, extremely conservative, and impractical, bee risk assessment guidance document, which is still in draft and not yet approved by the Member States, to inform its review of the neonicotinoid seed treatments.

All of this is desperately disappointing given the intention to conduct a comprehensive review of the risk to bee health.

We are obviously now concerned that an innovative active ingredient like Thiamethoxam may be penalized despite its excellent use characteristics: an extremely low dose; long lasting protection against pests that destroy crops; and used in the safest possible way through seed treatment resulting in fewer insecticide sprays over the course of the growing season. The safety of Thiamethoxam for bees is reinforced by years of extensive monitoring in the field and based on millions of hectares of treated seed use without a single substantiated report of hive destruction.

If neonicotinoid seed treatments like Thiamethoxam are restricted, farmers will have to use insecticides which have a higher environmental load, perversely increasing the risk to bee health.

\_\_\_\_\_



Independent analysis also suggests that there would be significant damage (perhaps more than €17bn over the next 5 years) to European agriculture and the wider economy.

Productivity in key crops like corn, winter wheat and barley, oilseed rape, sugar beet, and sunflower would fall by up to 40%. Grower margins would be eroded forcing them to scale back or end production of certain crops like OSR and Beet in many parts of Europe. Others would go out of business. Europe's export of wheat and barley would drop whilst net imports of corn and soybean would increase significantly, particularly for animal feed. In addition, Europe's world leading corn seed production industry, which makes a strong contribution to the economies of France, Hungary and Romania, would be seriously damaged and would possibly relocate outside of the EU.

In our view, it is therefore necessary to conduct the comprehensive review that was initially foreseen to avoid the risk of arriving at the wrong conclusions from a rushed process that could have disastrous implications for agriculture and ironically for bee health.

It's clear that we need healthy and thriving bee populations. The sustainability of agriculture and – indirectly our business – depends on this. But we also need safe, modern, and innovative pesticides like Thiamethoxam if we are to produce the food we need. Rather than looking at the theoretical hazard we need to look at how bees and pesticides co-exist together in a sustainable agriculture system.

Given our determination to look at farming in a holistic way I would like to assure you that we are open to work with any stakeholder who shares our goal of sustaining a thriving bee population in a sustainable agriculture system where the safest and most innovative pesticides are used.

Nevertheless, I would call on you to ask DG SANCO to extend the timescales and remit given to EFSA to ensure the comprehensive review on pesticides and bee health, which was initially promised, can be carried out. This would ensure that a holistic view emerges and informed decisions can be taken.

For your information, this letter is being sent to Minister of Agriculture across Member States.

Yours sincerely,





[Redacted]  
[Redacted]

Tel. [Redacted]  
[Redacted]  
Tel. [Redacted]  
[Redacted]

Syngenta AG  
Werk Rosental  
Schwarzwaldallee 215  
CH-4058 Basel

www.syngenta.com

3

**To: Commissioner John Dalli**  
**Cc: Commissioner Antonio Tajani**  
**Commissioner Dacian Cioloș**  
**Commissioner Janez Potočnik**  
**Commissioner Máire Geoghegan-Quinn**

June 4 2012

**Subject: Intention of French Ministry of Agriculture to suspend innovative crop protection technology without sound scientific evidence base**

Dear Mr. Commissioner,

We are writing to you with respect to the announcement on Friday June 1st by the French Minister of Agriculture who indicated his intention to withdraw the registration of our product, Cruiser® OSR, which contains the active substance Thiamethoxam, (TMX). The product is a seed treatment for oil seed rape.

We are seriously concerned by this announcement and its implications for a robust evidence based approach to regulatory decision-making in the European Union.

CRUISER OSR® is the most effective and convenient way of controlling damaging pests in oilseed rape, reducing the use of chemical sprays. Without it, up to 30% of the crop would be lost. It helps farmers to maximize crop productivity and to ensure food is plentiful, high quality and affordable.

The intention to suspend has been taken on the basis of one experimental study, conducted by Michael Henry et al. This study found that at extremely high dose rates the ability of bees to return to the hive was impaired. The study was conducted entirely under laboratory conditions and the bees were never exposed to field crops actually treated with TMX.

Furthermore, this experimental study has not been validated by expert panels and is completely at odds with the reality in the field. Over 650,000 hectares of oil seed rape have been treated in France this year without any incidents of damage to bee health delivering more than €100m of additional value which benefits farmers, the economy, and ultimately, consumers.

In Europe, over 3m hectares have been treated without incident.

ANSES (French Safety Agency) confirmed that the dose rate used in the experimental study was too high and, while recognizing that the new methodology (utilizing RFID markers) is interesting and could be used in field conditions, stand by their previous evaluations concerning the safety of CRUISER® OSR which are entirely consistent with the existing regulatory framework.

==



EFSA (European Food Safety Authority) has also concluded that it is cautious about drawing definite conclusions from the Henry et al. study, arguing they would need to be repeated at different dose rates and in other field situations.

Not surprisingly, both agencies recommend further studies be undertaken before any regulatory action is taken.

As the action announced by the Minister is not therefore supported by the ANSES review or by EFSA, or by any evidence of damage to bee health in the field, we are obviously asking him to explain to farmers and the public why he proposes to suspend this important, innovative, and environmentally sustainable product in France.

Please be assured, Mr. Commissioner, that Syngenta fully acknowledges the importance of bee health for sustainable agriculture and, in particular, ensuring all of our products are safe for human health and the environment.

In the case of Cruiser® OSR, the safety of bees has been key in the regulatory process due to the uptake and transport of the product through the plant. The company conducted studies directly in the field and over four years to address this question and the tests have shown the absence of any impact of the use of CRUISER® OSR on bee colonies.

Furthermore, there is a wide body of scientific evidence which makes clear that the bee health problem is multifactorial but with the absence of habitat and nutrition playing a key role in the decline of pollinators. For this reason, Syngenta has pioneered several schemes such as "Operation Pollinator" which has cultivated over 2,500 hectares of habitat and nutrition in the EU engaging more than 2,000 farmers and growers in the process delivering some impressive results.

Mr. Commissioner, we would like to assure you of our commitment to attaining the highest standards of safety possible for our crop protection solutions and to undertake any research that would be needed to improve our understanding of the bee issue.

We do, however, object in the strongest possible terms, to the announcement made by the French Ministry of Agriculture which is not based on scientific fact and ultimately penalizes the farmer, the environment, and the consumer.

In the meetings which take place in the Commission and with the Member States in the days and weeks ahead on this subject, we would ask that science and sound technical evaluation is put at the heart of the decision making criteria. This is essential for the continued integrity, credibility, and robustness of the EU regulatory framework for plant protection products.

We remain at the disposal of you and your colleagues to answer any questions.

Best regards,

[Redacted signature and contact information]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

A:AU  
C:GHISM

10. 04. 2012

Mr Dacian Cioloș  
EU Commissioner for Agriculture and Rural Development

April 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2012

## 5th Forum for the Future of Agriculture

*Meeting the Food and Environmental Challenge: Resource efficiency, innovation and governance*

Dear Commissioner Cioloș,

We are writing to thank you for your excellent presentation and contribution to the *5th Forum for the Future of Agriculture*. We are greatly indebted to you for your keynote speech which we know was very well received and much appreciated by the delegates present.

We hope that you also found the day's proceedings interesting and that you felt, as we did, that the various debates helped to stimulate our thinking on this subject. After the success of the previous Forums, we were again overwhelmed with the interest in FFA and the 1400 applications to attend this year was an extraordinary response. We believe that this shows the significant interest in exploring how we govern and find the finance for both food security and environmental sustainability at a time when there are so many competing demands on the attention of our leaders - not least with respect to strained public finances and political changes in the Arab world.

This subject of food and environmental security therefore remains vitally important and will continue to challenge us all. We believe that the European Union can and should be in the vanguard of developing sound and sustainable policies providing leadership to other countries as their economies expand. The challenge of food and environmental security will also frame the debate surrounding the CAP reform as it will hopefully find an agreement next year. With this in mind, we will continue to use the FFA platform to promote new thinking and ideas through our regional events in Madrid and the Czech Republic this year before we return to Brussels with our 6<sup>th</sup> *Forum for the Future of Agriculture* in March 2013.

Once again, allow us to convey our sincere thanks to you for your expert and most interesting intervention. We look forward to continuing to work with you as the debate continues to evolve.

Yours sincerely,

[Redacted signature]

European Landowners' Organization

Syngenta Brussels

RISE Foundation



[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

5

A(12)131603.txt

From: WEISS Stephanie (CAB-CIOLOS)  
Sent: lundi 6 février 2012 12:35  
To: [REDACTED]@europabio.org  
Cc: UJUPAN Alina-Stefania (CAB-CIOLOS); SUCIU Viorica-Claudia (CAB-CIOLOS)  
Subject: Re: Join us on 27/03 to discuss whether biotech can help us face some of our most daunting challenges yet! Ares (2012)147306

Dear [REDACTED]

Mr Häusler has asked me to thank you for this invitation which you addressed to him and other Cabinet Members.

After having carefully checked the availabilities within the Cabinet, we came to the conclusion that no-one will be able to take part at the event on 27 March.

Nevertheless, Mr Häusler wishes you a successful exchange of views.

Kind regards,

Stephanie Weiss  
Assistant to Mr Häusler  
Head of Cabinet  
Cabinet of Commissioner Ciolo&#537;  
Tel.: (+32/2 295.13.77)  
Fax: (+32/2 299.53.87)

From: [REDACTED] [mailto:[REDACTED]@europabio.org]  
Sent: Wednesday, February 01, 2012 3:25 PM  
To: HAEUSLER Georg (CAB-CIOLOS)  
Subject: Join us on 27/03 to discuss whether biotech can help us face some of our most daunting challenges yet!

Dear Mr. Haeusler,

We very much hope that you are able to join our morning event on Tuesday 27th March in Brussels with Commissioner John Dalli and Commissioner Maire Geoghegan-Quinn to exchange views on the many concrete benefits offered by biotechnology in our daily lives. MEP Françoise Grossetête has kindly offered to host the event in the European Parliament which should offer an ideal setting for an open and constructive debate regarding where and how biotechnology can contribute to our increased, health, food, environmental and economic sustainability in Europe.

We will also be launching a joint Ernst & Young/EuropaBio report on what concrete measures Member States have put in place to foster and support the development of biotech SMEs in their countries.

Finally, we will round up the event with a lunch buffet to which you are cordially invited and during which young scientists will offer participants the opportunity to investigate biotech experiments.

Please find our invitation and registration details hereunder.

I very much look forward to seeing you in just under 2 months' time.

Very best wishes,

**syngenta**

Tel: [REDACTED]  
Fax: [REDACTED]

Ref. Ares(2012)178597 - 16/02/2012

Syngenta Agro, S.A.  
Ribera del Loira, 8-10, 3ª planta  
28042 Madrid  
Madrid  
Spain  
www.syngentaagro.es

6  
A:GH  
C:SM/AC/A

Madrid, 15 de febrero de 2012

**ASUNTO: Invitación al Quinto Foro Internacional sobre el futuro de la Agricultura**

A la atención del Jefe del Gabinete del Comisario de Agricultura  
Sr.D. Georg Häusler

16. 02. 2012

El próximo día 27 de Marzo de 2012 se celebrará en Bruselas el "5th Forum for the Future of Agriculture". Tras el éxito de anteriores ediciones donde prestigiosos ponentes estimularon el debate abierto sobre los retos y soluciones para la agricultura europea y mundial, esta nueva edición del foro centrará la atención en

**"Meeting the Food & Environmental Challenge: Resource efficiency, innovation and governance"**

La jornada será presidida por Franz FISCHLER, y contará con la participación de importantes personalidades en representación, entre otros, de la Comisión Europea, el Parlamento Europeo, los Estados Miembros, el mundo científico y el sector privado, entre ellos Dacian CIOLOS Comisario de Agricultura, Jánež POTOČNIK, Comisario de Medio Ambiente, Mauricio LOPES, director ejecutivo de Embrapa, la Corporación Brasileña de Investigación Agrícola y José Manuel SILVA RODRIGUEZ, director general de Agricultura y Desarrollo Rural de la Comisión Europea. Para su información y documentación, incluimos junto a esta carta el programa provisional del evento.

Como Director General de Syngenta en Iberia, empresa participante en la organización del evento, es para mí un placer invitarle a este **Quinto Foro Internacional sobre el futuro de la Agricultura**, en la confianza de que le será de gran interés. Así mismo, nos gustaría contar con su asistencia a la cena informal, "Country Dinner", el lunes 26 de Marzo en The Square, donde tendremos la ocasión de compartir puntos de vista sobre temas de especial importancia para la agricultura de nuestro país, entre representantes relevantes de la administración y el sector agrícola. La cena comenzará con un cocktail a las 18.00 durante el que se presentará una exposición sobre "Modelos de Agricultura Intensiva Sostenible".

Le rogamos que nos confirme su asistencia a los eventos anteriores. Agradecemos su contestación incluso en el caso en que lamentablemente le fuera imposible asistir, con el fin de tramitar las reservas. Para ello, le agradecería que se pusiera en contacto con mi asistente [REDACTED] móvil: [REDACTED].

Con el deseo de contar con su participación y tener la ocasión de saludarle personalmente en Bruselas,

Un cordial saludo.

[REDACTED SIGNATURE]

Quinto Foro Internacional sobre el futuro de la Agricultura: martes 27 de Marzo de 2012, de 8:45 a 17:00 en The Square Meeting Centre en Bruselas. (<http://www.squares-brussels.com>)

Todas las sesiones tendrán traducción simultánea al español.

Para más información sobre el Forum: <http://www.forumforagriculture.com/>

1950

[REDACTED]

SECRET

1951

1952

SECRET

1953

CONFIDENTIAL

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

1954