



EUROPEAN COMMISSION

DIRECTORATE-GENERAL
ENVIRONMENT

Directorate B - Circular Economy & Green Growth
Unit B1 – Sustainable Production, Products and Consumption
The Head of Unit

Ms Vicky Cann
Corporate Europe Observatory
Rue d'Edimbourg 26
1050 Bruxelles

Advance copy by email :
ask+request-6394-@ec.europa.eu

Dear Madam,

Subject: Your application for access to documents – Ref GestDem No 2019/0939

We refer to your e-mail dated 14/02/2019 in which you make a request for access to documents, registered on 18/02/2019 under the reference numbers GestDem No 2019/0939.

Under GestDem No 2019/0939 you request access to “*a list of all lobby meetings held by DG Environment since 31 May 2018 where single-use plastics were discussed. The list should include the names of the individuals and organisations attending; the date; and any minutes / notes produced. I would additionally like to receive any emails or other correspondence related to these meetings*”.

Please note that a list of all lobby meetings held by DG ENV as requested does not exist. However, according to the Commission’s code of good administrative behavior, we compiled such a list. We have identified 28 meetings within the scope of your request, as well as related correspondence for 20 of these meetings.

You will attached

- A list of the identified meetings and of the identified documents
- Copies of the identified documents

Please note that

- for document Ares(2018)6211158 one of the attachment can not be disclosed as it is ‘strictly private and confidential’.
- for document Ares(2018)6236948 one of the attachment can not be disclosed as requested by the owner:

The disclosure of the attachment would undermine the protection of our company’s legitimate commercial interests within the meaning of art. 4(2) 1st indent, Regulation 1049/2001 regarding public access to European Parliament, Council and Commission documents, and should therefore be refused.

Here are the reasons: The attachment explains the complexity, time, resources and steps required to make the industrial transformation to implement the plastics straw ban and tethered caps design requirement. This involves our company making significant technical changes and completely reorganising our supply chain. The attachment not only contains commercially sensitive information such as development costs, estimated capital investments, resources needs, deployment plans and anticipated volumes, but also outlines our company's intended commercial strategy, which is itself commercially sensitive.

Please note that some of the documents to which you have requested access contain personal data. This is reason why names of individuals are generally not indicated.

Pursuant to Article 4(1)(b) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, access to a document has to be refused if its disclosure would undermine the protection of privacy and the integrity of the individual, in particular in accordance with European Union legislation regarding the protection of personal data.

The applicable legislation in this field is Regulation (EU) 2018/1725 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 October 2018 on the protection of natural persons with regard to the processing of personal data by the Union institutions, bodies, offices and agencies and on the free movement of such data, and repealing Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 and Decision No 1247/2002/EC1 ('Regulation 2018/1725').

Indeed, Article 3(1) of Regulation 2018/1725 provides that personal data 'means any information relating to an identified or identifiable natural person [...]'. The Court of Justice has specified that any information, which by reason of its content, purpose or effect, is linked to a particular person is to be considered as personal data.²

Please note in this respect that the names, signatures, functions, telephone numbers and/or initials pertaining to staff members of an institution are to be considered personal data.³

In its judgment in Case C-28/08 P (Bavarian Lager)⁴, the Court of Justice ruled that when a request is made for access to documents containing personal data, the Data Protection Regulation becomes fully applicable⁵

¹ Official Journal L 205 of 21.11.2018, p. 39.

² Judgment of the Court of Justice of the European Union of 20 December 2017 in Case C-434/16, *Peter Nowak v Data Protection Commissioner*, request for a preliminary ruling, paragraphs 33-35, [ECLI:EU:C:2017:994](#).

³ Judgment of the General Court of 19 September 2018 in case T-39/17, *Port de Brest v Commission*, paragraphs 43-44, [ECLI:EU:T:2018:560](#).

⁴ Judgment of 29 June 2010 in Case C-28/08 P, *European Commission v The Bavarian Lager Co. Ltd*, [EU:C:2010:378](#), paragraph 59.

⁵ Whereas this judgment specifically related to Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 December 2000 on the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data by the Community institutions and bodies and on the free movement of such data, the principles set out therein are also applicable under the new data protection regime established by Regulation 2018/1725.

Pursuant to Article 9(1)(b) of Regulation 2018/1725, ‘personal data shall only be transmitted to recipients established in the Union other than Union institutions and bodies if ‘[t]he recipient establishes that it is necessary to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest and the controller, where there is any reason to assume that the data subject’s legitimate interests might be prejudiced, establishes that it is proportionate to transmit the personal data for that specific purpose after having demonstrably weighed the various competing interests’.

Only if these conditions are fulfilled and the processing constitutes lawful processing in accordance with the requirements of Article 5 of Regulation 2018/1725, can the transmission of personal data occur.

According to Article 9(1)(b) of Regulation 2018/1725, the European Commission has to examine the further conditions for a lawful processing of personal data only if the first condition is fulfilled, namely if the recipient has established that it is necessary to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest. It is only in this case that the European Commission has to examine whether there is a reason to assume that the data subject’s legitimate interests might be prejudiced and, in the affirmative, establish the proportionality of the transmission of the personal data for that specific purpose after having demonstrably weighed the various competing interests.

In your request, you do not put forward any arguments to establish the necessity to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest. Therefore, the European Commission does not have to examine whether there is a reason to assume that the data subject’s legitimate interests might be prejudiced.

Notwithstanding the above, please note that there are reasons to assume that the legitimate interests of the data subjects concerned would be prejudiced by disclosure of the personal data reflected in the documents, as there is a real and non-hypothetical risk that such public disclosure would harm their privacy and subject them to unsolicited external contacts.

Consequently, I conclude that, pursuant to Article 4(1)(b) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, access cannot be granted to the personal data, as the need to obtain access thereto for a purpose in the public interest has not been substantiated and there is no reason to think that the legitimate interests of the individuals concerned would not be prejudiced by disclosure of the personal data concerned.

In case you would disagree with the assessment that the redacted data are personal data which can only be disclosed if such disclosure is legitimate under the applicable rules on the protection of personal data, you are entitled, in accordance with Article 7(2) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, to submit a confirmatory application requesting the Commission to review this position.

Such a confirmatory application should be addressed within 15 working days upon receipt of this letter to the Secretariat-General of the Commission at the following address:

European Commission

Secretary-General
Transparency unit SG-B-4
BERL 5/288
B-1049 Bruxelles or by email to: sg-acc-doc@ec.europa.eu

Yours sincerely,

Emmanuelle Maire
Head of Unit

Encl. List of meetings – related correspondence