

EUROPEAN COMMISSION

DIRECTORATE-GENERAL FOR AGRICULTURE AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT

The Director-General

Brussels, DG/JP/I.3/KVK/VA D(2019) 7569112

By registered letter with acknowledgment of receipt

Klaus Buster Jensen Emil Holms Kanal 20 0999 København C Denmark

Advance copy by email: klje@dr.dk

Subject: Your application for access to documents – Ref GestDem No 2019/5480

Dear Sir,

We refer to your e-mail dated 25/09/2019 in which you make a request for access to documents, registered on 25/09/2019 under the above mentioned reference number.

You request access to: "All communication in the form of documents and meetings (agendas, meetings, minutes of meetings) between DG Agri (including the commissioner, members of the cabinet and any staff in DG Agri) and the Danish Agriculture and Food Council (DAFC) since January 1. 2015 until January 1. 2019."

We have identified 28 documents related to your request of which a list is attached as well as the identified documents.

You may reuse the documents of the Commission free of charge for non-commercial and commercial purposes provided that the source is acknowledged, that you do not distort the original meaning or message of the documents. Please note that the Commission does not assume liability stemming from the reuse.

Please note that some of the documents were received by the Commission from third parties. They are disclosed for information only and cannot be re-used without the agreement of the originator, who may hold a copyright on them. They do not reflect the position of the Commission and cannot be quoted as such.

The documents to which you request access contain personal data. Pursuant to Article 4(1)(b) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, access to a document has to be refused if its disclosure would undermine the protection of privacy and the integrity of the individual, in particular in accordance with European Union legislation regarding the protection of personal data.

The applicable legislation in this field is Regulation (EC) No 2018/1725 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 October 2018 on the protection of natural persons

with regard to the processing of personal data by the Union institutions, bodies, offices and agencies and on the free movement of such data, and repealing Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 and Decision No 1247/2002/EC1 ('Regulation (EC) No 2018/1725').

Indeed, Article 3(1) of Regulation (EC) No 2018/1725 provides that personal data 'means any information relating to an identified or identifiable natural person [...]'. The Court of Justice has specified that any information, which by reason of its content, purpose or effect, is linked to a particular person is to be considered as personal data.2

Please note in this respect that the names, signatures, functions, telephone numbers and/or initials pertaining to staff members of an institution are to be considered personal data.3

In its judgment in Case C-28/08 P (Bavarian Lager)4, the Court of Justice ruled that when a request is made for access to documents containing personal data, the Data Protection Regulation becomes fully applicable.5

Pursuant to Article 9(1)(b) of Regulation (EC) No 2018/1725, 'personal data shall only be transmitted to recipients established in the Union other than Union institutions and bodies if '[t]he recipient establishes that it is necessary to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest and the controller, where there is any reason to assume that the data subject's legitimate interests might be prejudiced, establishes that it is proportionate to transmit the personal data for that specific purpose after having demonstrably weighed the various competing interests'.

Only if these conditions are fulfilled and the processing constitutes lawful processing in accordance with the requirements of Article 5 of Regulation (EC) No 2018/1725, can the transmission of personal data occur.

According to Article 9(1)(b) of Regulation (EC) No 2018/1725, the European Commission has to examine the further conditions for a lawful processing of personal data only if the first condition is fulfilled, namely if the recipient has established that it is necessary to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest. It is

¹ Official Journal L 205 of 21.11.2018, p. 39.

² Judgment of the Court of Justice of the European Union of 20 December 2017 in Case C-434/16, *Peter Nowak v Data Protection Commissioner*, request for a preliminary ruling, paragraphs 33-35, ECLI:EU:C:2017:994.

³ Judgment of the General Court of 19 September 2018 in case T-39/17, *Port de Brest v Commission*, paragraphs 43-44, ECLI:EU:T:2018:560.

⁴ Judgment of 29 June 2010 in Case C-28/08 P, European Commission v The Bavarian Lager Co. Ltd, EU:C:2010:378, paragraph 59.

⁵ Whereas this judgment specifically related to Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 December 2000 on the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data by the Community institutions and bodies and on the free movement of such data, the principles set out therein are also applicable under the new data protection regime established by Regulation (EC) No 2018/1725.

only in this case that the European Commission has to examine whether there is a reason to assume that the data subject's legitimate interests might be prejudiced and, in the affirmative, establish the proportionality of the transmission of the personal data for that specific purpose after having demonstrably weighed the various competing interests.

In your request, you do not put forward any arguments to establish the necessity to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest. Therefore, the European Commission does not have to examine whether there is a reason to assume that the data subject's legitimate interests might be prejudiced.

Notwithstanding the above, please note that there are reasons to assume that the legitimate interests of the data subjects concerned would be prejudiced by disclosure of the personal data reflected in the documents, as there is a real and non-hypothetical risk that such public disclosure would harm their privacy and subject them to unsolicited external contacts.

Consequently, I conclude that, pursuant to Article 4(1)(b) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, access cannot be granted to the personal data, as the need to obtain access thereto for a purpose in the public interest has not been substantiated and there is no reason to think that the legitimate interests of the individuals concerned would not be prejudiced by disclosure of the personal data concerned.

As to the handwritten signatures, which are biometric data, there is a risk that their disclosure would prejudice the legitimate interests of the persons concerned.

In case you would disagree with the assessment that the redacted data are personal data which can only be disclosed if such disclosure is legitimate under the applicable rules on the protection of personal data, you are entitled, in accordance with Article 7(2) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, to submit a confirmatory application requesting the Commission to review this position (see details below).

Having examined the documents No 5.B.1 and 6.B.1, under the provisions of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001 regarding public access to documents, I have come to the conclusion that they may be partially disclosed. Some parts of the documents have been blanked out as their disclosure is prevented by exception to the right of access laid down in Article 4 of this Regulation.

The redacted parts of the documents contain commercially sensitive business information of the company that submitted them;

Disclosure of these parts would undermine the protection of the commercial interests of the company that submitted them, as putting this information in the public domain would affect their competitive position on the market. Therefore the exception laid down in Article 4(2) first indent of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001 applies to this document.

The exceptions laid down in Article 4(2) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001 apply unless there is an overriding public interest in disclosure of the document. We have examined whether there could be an overriding public interest in disclosure, but we have not been able to identify such an interest.

In accordance with Article 7(2) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, you are entitled to make a confirmatory application requesting the Commission to review this position.

Such a confirmatory application should be addressed within 15 working days upon receipt of this letter to the Secretary-General of the Commission at the following address:

European Commission
Secretariat-General
Transparency, Document Management & Access to Documents (SG.C.1)
BERL 7/076
B-1049 Bruxelles

or by email to: sg-acc-doc@ec.europa.eu

Jerzy PLEWA

Encl.: 28 doc. + 5 lists