



EUROPEAN COMMISSION

Brussels, 25.10.2022  
C(2022) 7858 final

Mr Andrew Rettman  
EUObserver  
Résidence Palace - International  
Press Centre, Rue de la Loi 155,  
1040 Brussels  
Belgium

**DECISION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 4 OF THE  
IMPLEMENTING RULES TO REGULATION (EC) NO 1049/2001<sup>1</sup>**

**Subject: Your confirmatory application for access to documents under  
Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001 - GESTDEM 2022/1057**

Dear Mr Rettman,

I refer to your e-mail of 5 April 2022, registered on the same day, in which you submitted a confirmatory application in accordance with Article 7(2) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001 regarding public access to European Parliament, Council and Commission documents<sup>2</sup> (hereafter ‘Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001’).

**1. SCOPE OF YOUR REQUEST**

In your initial application of 18 February 2022, registered on 22 February 2022, addressed to the Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers, you requested access to:

‘documents which contain the following information:

How much did the EU Commission spend on funding the work of the anti-racism coordinator so far?

How much did the EU Commission spend on funding the work of the combating antisemitism coordinator since that office began its work?

---

<sup>1</sup> OJ L 345, 29.12.2001, p. 94.

<sup>2</sup> OJ L 145, 31.5.2001, p. 43.

How much did the EU Commission spend on funding the office of the combating anti-Muslim hatred coordinator since it began its work?

How many staff work in the office of the anti-racism coordinator today?

How many staff work in the office of the combating antisemitism coordinator?

How many staff worked in the office of the combating anti-Muslim hatred coordinator the last time there was an incumbent?'.

In its initial reply of 1 April 2022, the Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers identified two categories of documents falling under the scope of your request:

- A. Internal documents containing information on the human resources allocated specifically to the coordinators, namely:
  - Annex 1 to the Communication to the Commission - Allocation of human resources and decentralised administrative appropriations for 2020, SEC(2019) 465 final (hereafter ‘document 1’);
  - Communication to the Commission – Complementary allocation of human resources for 2020, SEC(2020) 282 final (hereafter ‘document 2’);
  - Annex 1 to the Communication to the Commission - Allocation of human resources and decentralised administrative appropriations for 2021, SEC(2021) 93 final (hereafter ‘document 3’);
- B. Public Commission documents, to which the Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers had provided you the link, namely:
  - Multiannual work programme 2021-2022 of the Citizens, Equality, Rights and Values Programme (CERV), available in the reference documents of the Funding & tender opportunities portal: <https://ec.europa.eu/info/funding-tenders/opportunities/portal/screen/how-to-participate/reference-documents;programCode=CERV> (hereafter ‘document 4’);
  - Annual Work Programme 2014-2015, <https://ec.europa.eu/info/funding-tenders/opportunities/portal/screen/how-to-participate/reference-documents;programCode=CERV> (hereafter ‘document category 5’);
  - Annual Work Programmes 2016-2020 of the Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme (REC): available in the reference documents of the Funding and tender opportunities portal <https://ec.europa.eu/info/funding-tenders/opportunities/portal/screen/how-to-participate/reference-documents;programCode=REC>, (hereafter ‘document category 6’).

As regards the documents under the first category, the Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers granted you full access, save parts of the documents which contained information outside the scope of your request.

In your confirmatory application, you request a review of this position and, in particular, you argue that the Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers did not adequately reply to your request.

Furthermore, you clarify that ‘[you] asked for details of human resources and budgets allocated to the three different EU offices. What [you] got contains none of this information - it's just 3 PDFs with almost everything blurred out except a few lines on AD/AST posts’.

Against this background, the European Commission has carried out a renewed search for the documents falling within the scope of your request.

The Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers referred you to the website where the requested documents were publicly available. For your convenience, please find the detailed list below:

- Multiannual work programme 2021-2022 of the Citizens, Equality, Rights and Values Programme (CERV), C(2021) 2583 final, [https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/default/files/1\\_en\\_annexe\\_acte\\_autonome\\_part1\\_v8.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/default/files/1_en_annexe_acte_autonome_part1_v8.pdf) (hereafter ‘document 4’);
- Annual Work Programme 2014 of the Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme (REC), C(2014) 2557 final, [https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec\\_awp\\_2014\\_act\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec_awp_2014_act_en.pdf) and its annex [https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec\\_awp\\_2014\\_annex\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec_awp_2014_annex_en.pdf) (hereafter ‘document 5.1’);
- Annual Work Programme 2015 of the Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme (REC), C(2015) 1996 final, [https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec\\_awp\\_2015\\_act\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec_awp_2015_act_en.pdf) and its annex [https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec\\_awp\\_2015\\_annex\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec_awp_2015_annex_en.pdf) (hereafter ‘document 5.2’);
- Annual Work Programme 2016 of the Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme (REC), C(2016) 1883 final, [https://ec.europa.eu/research/participants/data/ref/other\\_eu\\_prog/rec/wp/rec-awp-2016\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/research/participants/data/ref/other_eu_prog/rec/wp/rec-awp-2016_en.pdf) (hereafter ‘document 6.1’);
- Annual Work Programme 2017 of the Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme (REC), C(2017) 1316 final, [https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec\\_2017\\_awp\\_commission-implementing-decision\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec_2017_awp_commission-implementing-decision_en.pdf), its annex [https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec\\_2017\\_annex\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec_2017_annex_en.pdf) and corrigendum C(2017)7154 final [https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec\\_2017\\_annex\\_corr\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/justice/grants1/programmes-2014-2020/files/rec_2017_annex_corr_en.pdf) (hereafter ‘document 6.2’);
- Annual Work Programme 2018 of the Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme (REC), C(2017) 8518 final, [https://ec.europa.eu/research/participants/data/ref/other\\_eu\\_prog/rec/wp/rec-awp-2018\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/research/participants/data/ref/other_eu_prog/rec/wp/rec-awp-2018_en.pdf) (hereafter ‘document 6.3’);
- Annual Work Programme 2019 of the Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme (REC), C(2018) 7916 final,

[https://ec.europa.eu/research/participants/data/ref/other\\_eu\\_prog/rec/wp/rec-awp-2019\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/research/participants/data/ref/other_eu_prog/rec/wp/rec-awp-2019_en.pdf) (hereafter ‘document 6.4’);

- Annual Work Programme 2020 of the Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme (REC), C(2019) 7824 final, [https://ec.europa.eu/research/participants/data/ref/other\\_eu\\_prog/rec/wp/rec-awp-2020\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/research/participants/data/ref/other_eu_prog/rec/wp/rec-awp-2020_en.pdf) (hereafter ‘document 6.5’).

Following this renewed search, I confirm that the Commission does not hold any other documents that would correspond to the description given in your application, namely ‘human resources and budgets allocated to the three different EU offices’, apart from the documents already disclosed to you.

However, as a measure of transparency and in order to give you more context on the documents that have been provided to you, the European Commission will disclose information relevant to your request, compiled from documents which do not fall in the scope of the request, as a reply to a request for information.

The resources in relation to the coordinators are covered from the Commission’s operational budget; there are no additional funds allocated at the disposal of the coordinators. Please note that there is no dedicated budget line for the work of the Coordinators. The work of the coordinators is quantifiable as budget available for action grants, and for other activities such as meetings, workshops, training, studies and collection of tools and good practices. This is funded mainly through the yearly work programmes of the Rights Equality and Citizenship Programme (REC, until 2020) and the Citizens, Equality, Rights and Values Programmes (CERV, as from 2021), where a dedicated procurement budget is allocated for these kind of activities, with a particular reference to the work of the Coordinators. The budget lines in question are 33 02 02 under REC and 07 06 01 under the CERV programme, which may include antisemitism and anti-Muslim hatred. In addition, there could be activities on combating racism, antisemitism and anti-Muslim hatred that are covered by other budgetary lines under the Citizens, Equality, Rights and Values Programme, as well as by other EU funding programmes (Justice, Horizon Europe, Erasmus +, etc).

Under these budget lines, on average, since 2016, 460 000 EUR have been allocated to the activities of a) the High Level Group on combating hate speech and hate crime (previously called High Level Group on combating racism and xenophobia), that is the policy umbrella under which the two coordinators have been operating; b) the activities of the coordinator on combating antisemitism and c) the activities of the coordinator on combating anti-Muslim hatred. In the Multiannual Work Programme 2021-2022 of the Citizens, Equality, Rights and Values Programme (CERV), the budget line 07 06 01: Promote equality and rights has allocated 27 324 300 euro for 2021 (p. 9 of the document), with 6 700 000 euro allocated to ‘Combating racism, xenophobia and all forms of intolerance’.

As a way of example, under the 2020 REC work programme, the unit had estimated that on a total of 540 000 EUR allocated for that year, 180 000 were earmarked for each of the two coordinators. A budget of about 200 000 EUR was allocated to the organisation of two EU Anti-racism Summits organised in respectively 2021 and 2022.

In addition, there are training activities offered to Commission staff to raise awareness on antisemitism and anti-Muslim hatred, which are funded through the Commission's learning and development budget. Since 2017, an average yearly amount of at least 2000 EUR has been allocated to each of the two respective Coordinators to run such trainings.

As regards human resource allocation, both the coordinator on combating anti-Semitism and fostering Jewish life and the coordinator on combating anti-Muslim hatred were nominated in December 2015. In both cases the tasks were entrusted to a staff member already working in the Directorate-General. An external staffing resource was partially allocated to assist the coordinator on combating anti-Semitism during the period from 1 June 2016 until September 2018. Since 2020, the coordinator on combating anti-Semitism is supported by 3 staff members. The Coordinator on combatting racism, appointed in 2021, is supported in by two additional staff members. The Coordinator combatting anti-Muslim hatred carried out the tasks without additional staff.

## **2. MEANS OF REDRESS**

Finally, I draw your attention to the means of redress available against this decision. You may either bring proceedings before the General Court or file a complaint with the European Ombudsman under the conditions specified respectively in Articles 263 and 228 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union.

Yours sincerely,

*For the Commission*  
*Ilze JUHANSONE*  
*Secretary-General*

