



EUROPEAN COMMISSION
DIRECTORATE-GENERAL
CLIMATE ACTION

CLIMA. 001 – Legal Affairs, Inter-Institutional Relations and Communication

Brussels,

By registered letter with acknowledgment of receipt

Belen BALANYA
Corporate Europe Observatory
Rue d'Edimbourg 26
1050 Brussels
Belgium

Advance copy by email:

ask+request-6216-79095b48@asktheeu.org

Subject: Your application for access to documents – GestDem 2018/6820

Dear Madam,

We refer to your e-mail dated 19 December 2018 in which you make a request for access to documents, registered on 20 December 2018 under the above-mentioned reference number.

You request access to:

1. All correspondence (including email) between 1st June 2016 and 30th November 2016 between the Commissioner for Climate Action and/or his cabinet and/or officials and representatives of DG CLIMA on one hand and representatives from the Confederation of European Private Foresters, Drax, Enviva, EUBIA (the European Biomass Industry Association), IEA Bioenergy, REA (UK renewable energy association), Bioenergy Europe (formerly AEBIOM), Svebio (the Swedish Bioenergy Association), DI Bioenergi (the Danish Bioenergy Association), Bioenergia (the Bioenergy Association of Finland), EBA, (the Estonian Biomass Association), EREA (the Estonian Renewable Energy Association), LATbio (The Latvian biomass association), LAEF (Latvian Renewable Energy federation) and/or WBA (World Bioenergy Association) on the other, in which the issue of sustainability criteria for biomass within the revised Renewable Energy Directive was addressed.
2. A list of meetings between 1st June 2016 and 30th November 2016 between officials and representatives of DG CLIMA on one hand and representatives from the Confederation of European Private Foresters, Drax, Enviva, EUBIA (the European Biomass Industry Association), IEA Bioenergy, REA (UK renewable energy association), Bioenergy Europe (formerly AEBIOM), Svebio (the Swedish Bioenergy Association), DI Bioenergi (the Danish Bioenergy Association), Bioenergia (the Bioenergy Association of Finland), EBA, (the Estonian Biomass Association), EREA (the Estonian

Renewable Energy Association), LATbio (The Latvian biomass association), LAEF (Latvian Renewable Energy federation) and/or WBA (World Bioenergy Association) on the other, in which the issue of sustainability criteria for biomass within the revised Renewable Energy Directive was addressed.

Your application has been examined under the provisions of Regulation 1049/2001 (the access to documents Regulation)¹.

The first point of your application concerns the following documents:

	Format	Author	Date	Subject/Reference
1	Email	AEBIOM	23 November 2016	Ares(2016)6606533
2	Letter	AEBIOM	23 November 2016	Ares(2016)6606533
3	Paper	AEBIOM	23 November 2016	Ares(2016)6606533
4	Email	WBA	23 November 2016	Ares(2016)6575498
5	Paper	WBA	23 November 2016	Ares(2016)6575498
6	Paper	WBA	23 November 2016	Ares(2016)6575498
7	Email	CEPF	29 June 2016	Ares(2016)3079436
8	Paper	CEPF	29 June 2016	Ares(2016)3079436
9	Letter	EREF	10 October 2016	Ares(2016)5843537
10	Email	Renewable Energy Association	25 November 2016	Ares(2016)6627503
11	Letter	EREF	25 November 2016	Ares(2016)6627503
12	Email	AEBIOM	10 November 2016	Ares(2016)6372118

The Commission has received the requested documents from third parties. In accordance with Article 4(4) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, my service has consulted those third parties concerning the disclosure of the requested documents emanating from them.

¹ OJ L 145, 31.5.2001, p. 43.

Please find the documents enclosed with this letter. However, I regret to inform you that I cannot give you access to some parts of the documents 1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 9-13.

Pursuant to Article 4(1)(b) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, access to a document has to be refused if its disclosure would undermine the protection of privacy and the integrity of the individual, in particular in accordance with European Union legislation regarding the protection of personal data.

The applicable legislation in this field is Regulation (EC) No 2018/1725 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 October 2018 on the protection of natural persons with regard to the processing of personal data by the Union institutions, bodies, offices and agencies and on the free movement of such data, and repealing Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 and Decision No 1247/2002/EC² ('Regulation 2018/1725').

Some documents to which you request access contain personal data, in particular names, signatures, functions and/or telephone numbers. This personal data has been redacted from the disclosed documents.

Indeed, Article 3(1) of Regulation 2018/1725 provides that personal data 'means any information relating to an identified or identifiable natural person [...]'. The Court of Justice has specified that any information, which by reason of its content, purpose or effect, is linked to a particular person is to be considered as personal data.³

Please note in this respect that the names, signatures, functions, telephone numbers and/or initials pertaining to staff members of an institution are to be considered personal data.⁴

In its judgment in Case C-28/08 P (*Bavarian Lager*)⁵, the Court of Justice ruled that when a request is made for access to documents containing personal data, the Data Protection Regulation becomes fully applicable⁶

Pursuant to Article 9(1)(b) of Regulation 2018/1725, 'personal data shall only be transmitted to recipients established in the Union other than Union institutions and bodies if '[t]he recipient establishes that it is necessary to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest and the controller, where there is any reason to assume that the data subject's legitimate interests might be prejudiced, establishes that it is proportionate to

² Official Journal L 205 of 21.11.2018, p. 39.

³ Judgment of the Court of Justice of the European Union of 20 December 2017 in Case C-434/16, *Peter Nowak v Data Protection Commissioner*, request for a preliminary ruling, paragraphs 33-35, [ECLI:EU:C:2017:994](#).

⁴ Judgment of the General Court of 19 September 2018 in case T-39/17, *Port de Brest v Commission*, paragraphs 43-44, [ECLI:EU:T:2018:560](#).

⁵ Judgment of 29 June 2010 in Case C-28/08 P, *European Commission v The Bavarian Lager Co. Ltd*, [EU: C:2010:378](#), paragraph 59.

⁶ Whereas this judgment specifically related to Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 December 2000 on the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data by the Community institutions and bodies and on the free movement of such data, the principles set out therein are also applicable under the new data protection regime established by Regulation 2018/1725.

transmit the personal data for that specific purpose after having demonstrably weighed the various competing interests’.

Only if these conditions are fulfilled and the processing constitutes lawful processing in accordance with the requirements of Article 5 of Regulation 2018/1725, can the transmission of personal data occur.

In your request, you do not put forward any arguments to establish the necessity to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest. Therefore, the European Commission does not have to examine whether there is a reason to assume that the data subject’s legitimate interests might be prejudiced.

Notwithstanding the above, please note that there are reasons to assume that the legitimate interests of the data subjects concerned would be prejudiced by disclosure of the personal data reflected in the documents, as there is a real and non-hypothetical risk that such public disclosure would harm their privacy and subject them to unsolicited external contacts.

Consequently, I conclude that, pursuant to Article 4(1)(b) of Regulation 1049/2001, access cannot be granted to the personal data, as the need to obtain access thereto for a purpose in the public interest has not been substantiated and there is no reason to think that the legitimate interests of the individuals concerned would not be prejudiced by disclosure of the personal data concerned.

As regards the second point of your application, I regret to inform you that the Commission does not hold any document that would correspond to the description given in your application. Nevertheless, I would like to provide you certain information related to this point of your application.

As you may be aware, information on meetings with the participation of the Commissioner for Climate Action, his Cabinet, or our Director General is available in the public domain:

<http://ec.europa.eu/transparencyinitiative/meetings/meeting.do?host=523060f7-97c6-480b-8bb9-30bb409e650e>

<http://ec.europa.eu/transparencyinitiative/meetings/meeting.do?host=9778d998-6aed-40e3-a1d6-614db81c7918>

<http://ec.europa.eu/transparencyinitiative/meetings/meeting.do?host=d41e42be-7ff1-4635-bb4f-e47d38f886ed>

Within the mission of the Directorate General for Climate Action, its staff also meets different stakeholders at various occasions, and the services of the European Commission draw from the broadest possible sources to fulfil their mandate. This includes in particular public consultation on its policy initiatives to which any interested party can contribute, as well as information on events and conferences organised by Commission services. Extensive information on past and current public consultations and any events, such as stakeholder and expert meetings, is available on our website. The results of the Open Public Consultation for the preparation of the new Renewable Energy Directive for the period after 2020 can be found in the Commission website:

http://ec.europa.eu/clima/consultations/index_en.htm

<https://ec.europa.eu/energy/en/consultations/preparation-new-renewable-energy-directive-period-after-2020>

In case you would disagree with the assessment that the redacted data are personal data which can only be disclosed if such disclosure is legitimate under the applicable rules on the protection of personal data, you are entitled, in accordance with Article 7(2) of Regulation 1049/2001, to submit a confirmatory application requesting the Commission to review this position.

Such a confirmatory application should be addressed within 15 working days upon receipt of this letter to the Secretariat-General of the Commission at the following address:

European Commission
Secretariat-General
Unit C.1. 'Transparency, Document Management and Access to Documents'
BERL 7/076

B-1049 Bruxelles, or by email to: sg-acc-doc@ec.europa.eu

Yours faithfully,



Luca DE CARLI
Head of Unit