



EUROPEAN COMMISSION

DIRECTORATE-GENERAL
CLIMATE ACTION

 Ref. Ares(2019)5272405 - 16/08/2019

CLIMA. 001 – Legal Affairs, Inter-Institutional Relations and Communication

Brussels,

By registered letter with acknowledgment of receipt

Belen Balanya
Corporate Europe Observatory
Rue d'Edimbourg 26
1050 Brussels
Belgium

Advance copy by email: ask+request-7022-6700471a@asktheeu.org

Subject: Your application for access to documents – GestDem 2019/3784

Dear Ms. Balanya,

We refer to your e-mail dated 28 June 2019 in which you make a request for access to documents, registered on 2 July 2019 under the above-mentioned reference number.

You request access to:

” 1- All correspondence (including email) from 1st January 2018 to 28 June 2019 between the Commissioner for Climate Action and/or his cabinet and/or officials and representatives of DG CLIMA on one hand and representatives from Eurogas, GasNaturally, the International Association of Oil & Gas Producers (IOGP), Gas Infrastructure Europe (GIE), Marcogaz, IFIEC Europe, ENTSOG, ENTSOE, Eurelectric, Business Europe, CEFIC, Hydrogen Europe, Gas for Climate, Bioenergy Europe, European Biogas Association, National Grid, Open Grid Europe, Enagas, Gasunie, GRTgaz/GRDF/Engie, Terega, Statoil/Equinor, ExxonMobil, Shell, BP, Enagas, Snam, Fluxys, Gazprom, Weber Shandwick, Gplus, Fleishman-Hillard and/or FTI Consulting on the other, in which the gas market reform was addressed.

2 – A list of meetings from 1st January 2018 to 28 June 2019 between officials and representatives of DG CLIMA on one hand and representatives from Eurogas, GasNaturally, the International Association of Oil & Gas Producers (IOGP), Gas Infrastructure Europe (GIE), Marcogaz, IFIEC Europe, ENTSOG, ENTSOE, Eurelectric, Business Europe, CEFIC, Hydrogen Europe, Gas for Climate, Bioenergy Europe, European Biogas Association, National Grid, Open Grid Europe, Enagas, Gasunie, GRTgaz/GRDF/Engie, Terega, Statoil/Equinor, ExxonMobil, Shell, BP, Enagas, Snam, Fluxys, Gazprom, Weber Shandwick, Gplus, Fleishman-Hillard and/or FTI Consulting on the other, in which the gas market reform was addressed, and;

3 - Minutes of the meetings mentioned above”

Your application concerns the following documents:

	Author	Date	Subject/Reference
1	IOGP	24 March 2019	Ares(2019)3416715
2	IOGP	24 March 2019	Ares(2019)3416715
3	Eurogas	22 March 2019	Ares(2019)3356752
4	Eurogas	22 March 2019	Ares(2019)3356752
5	Equinor	3 October 2018	Ares(2018)5183199
6	Equinor	3 October 2018	Ares(2018)5183199
7	Gazprom	5 October 2019	Ares(2018)5126718
8	Engie	21 September 2018	Ares(2018)4896889
9	Engie	21 September 2018	Ares(2018)4896889
10	GD4S	26 September 2018	Ares(2018)4935548
11	Enagas	17 April 2018	Ares(2018)2064303
12	European Commission	16 April 2018	Ares(2018)2844143
13	European Commission	16 April 2018	Ares(2018)2844143
14	Engie	21 March 2018	Ares(2018)1553871
15	Engie	21 March 2018	Ares(2018)1553871
16	Uniper	7 March 2018	Ares(2018)1262361
17	Engie	21 March 2018	Ares(2018)1553871
18	Gas for Climate	22 February 2018	Ares(2018)1021315
19	Gas for Climate	22 February 2018	Ares(2018)1021315
20	European Commission	28 Mai 2019	Debriefing meeting DG CLIMA-ENTSOG

Please find the documents enclosed with this letter. However, I regret to inform you that I cannot give you access to some parts of the documents 1-8, 10-16 and 18-20.

Pursuant to Article 4(1)(b) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, access to a document has to be refused if its disclosure would undermine the protection of privacy and the integrity of the individual, in particular in accordance with European Union legislation regarding the protection of personal data.

The applicable legislation in this field is Regulation (EU) 2018/1725 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 October 2018 on the protection of natural persons with regard to the processing of personal data by the Union institutions, bodies, offices and agencies and on the free movement of such data, and repealing Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 and Decision No 1247/2002/EC¹ ('Regulation 2018/1725').

Some of the documents to which you request access contain personal data, in particular names and positions.

Indeed, Article 3(1) of Regulation 2018/1725 provides that personal data 'means any information relating to an identified or identifiable natural person [...]'. The Court of Justice has specified that any information, which by reason of its content, purpose or effect, is linked to a particular person is to be considered as personal data.²

Please note in this respect that the names, signatures, functions, telephone numbers and/or initials pertaining to staff members of an institution are to be considered personal data.³

In its judgment in Case C-28/08 P (*Bavarian Lager*)⁴, the Court of Justice ruled that when a request is made for access to documents containing personal data, the Data Protection Regulation becomes fully applicable⁵.

Pursuant to Article 9(1)(b) of Regulation 2018/1725, 'personal data shall only be transmitted to recipients established in the Union other than Union institutions and bodies if '[t]he recipient establishes that it is necessary to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest and the controller, where there is any reason to assume that the data subject's legitimate interests might be prejudiced, establishes that it is proportionate to transmit the personal data for that specific purpose after having demonstrably weighed the various competing interests'.

¹ Official Journal L 205 of 21.11.2018, p. 39.

² Judgment of the Court of Justice of the European Union of 20 December 2017 in Case C-434/16, *Peter Nowak v Data Protection Commissioner*, request for a preliminary ruling, paragraphs 33-35, [ECLI:EU:C:2017:994](#).

³ Judgment of the General Court of 19 September 2018 in case T-39/17, *Port de Brest v Commission*, paragraphs 43-44, [ECLI:EU:T:2018:560](#).

⁴ Judgment of 29 June 2010 in Case C-28/08 P, *European Commission v The Bavarian Lager Co. Ltd*, [EU:C:2010:378](#), paragraph 59.

⁵ Whereas this judgment specifically related to Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 December 2000 on the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data by the Community institutions and bodies and on the free movement of such data, the principles set out therein are also applicable under the new data protection regime established by Regulation 2018/1725.

Only if these conditions are fulfilled and the processing constitutes lawful processing in accordance with the requirements of Article 5 of Regulation 2018/1725, can the transmission of personal data occur.

According to Article 9(1)(b) of Regulation 2018/1725, the European Commission has to examine the further conditions for a lawful processing of personal data only if the first condition is fulfilled, namely if the recipient has established that it is necessary to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest. It is only in this case that the European Commission has to examine whether there is a reason to assume that the data subject's legitimate interests might be prejudiced and, in the affirmative, establish the proportionality of the transmission of the personal data for that specific purpose after having demonstrably weighed the various competing interests.

In your request, you do not put forward any arguments to establish the necessity to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest. Therefore, the European Commission does not have to examine whether there is a reason to assume that the data subject's legitimate interests might be prejudiced.

Notwithstanding the above, please note that there are reasons to assume that the legitimate interests of the data subjects concerned would be prejudiced by disclosure of the personal data reflected in the documents, as there is a real and non-hypothetical risk that such public disclosure would harm their privacy and subject them to unsolicited external contacts among other risks.

Consequently, I conclude that, pursuant to Article 4(1)(b) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, access cannot be granted to the personal data, as the need to obtain access thereto for a purpose in the public interest has not been substantiated and there is no reason to think that the legitimate interests of the individuals concerned would not be prejudiced by disclosure of the personal data concerned.

As regards the second point of your application, I regret to inform you that the Commission does not hold any document that would correspond to the description given in your application. Nevertheless, I would like to provide you certain information related to this point of your application.

As you may be aware, information on meetings with the participation of the Commissioner for Climate Action, his Cabinet, or our Director General is available in the public domain:

<http://ec.europa.eu/transparencyinitiative/meetings/meeting.do?host=523060f7-97c6-480b-8bb9-30bb409e650e>

<http://ec.europa.eu/transparencyinitiative/meetings/meeting.do?host=9778d998-6aed-40e3-a1d6-614db81c7918>

<http://ec.europa.eu/transparencyinitiative/meetings/meeting.do?host=d41e42be-7ff1-4635-bb4f-e47d38f886ed>

In case you would disagree with the assessment that the redacted data are personal data which can only be disclosed if such disclosure is legitimate under the applicable rules on the protection of personal data, you are entitled, in accordance with Article 7(2) of Regulation 1049/2001, to submit a confirmatory application requesting the Commission to review this position.

Such a confirmatory application should be addressed within 15 working days upon receipt of this letter to the Secretariat-General of the Commission at the following address:

European Commission
Secretariat-General
Unit C.1. 'Transparency, Document Management and Access to Documents'
BERL 7/076

B-1049 Bruxelles, or by email to: sg-acc-doc@ec.europa.eu

Yours sincerely,



Luca DE CARLI
Head of Unit