



EUROPEAN COMMISSION
DIRECTORATE-GENERAL FOR MOBILITY AND TRANSPORT

Directorate E - Aviation
E.1 - Aviation Policy

Brussels

MOVE.DDG2.E.1

Laura Döring
1 Long Lane
Borough
London, United Kingdom

**Sent by email with
acknowledgment of receipt:**
[ask+request-11228-
0e6bcd03@asktheeu.org](mailto:ask+request-11228-0e6bcd03@asktheeu.org)

Dear Madam,

Subject: Your application for access to documents – GESTDEM 2022/2793

We refer to your email of 10 May 2022 in which you make a request for access to documents, registered on the 17 May under the above-mentioned reference number as well as to our holding reply dated 8 June 2022.

You request access to the documents relating to the meeting between Verband der Chemischen Industrie e.V. and Walter Goetz, Filip Alexandru Negreanu Arboreanu and Rachel Smit, respectively Head and members of the Cabinet of the European Commissioner for Transport Adina-Ioana Vălean, which took place on 27/10/2021.

We have identified the following documents as falling within the scope of your application:

- Emails concerning « Gesprächsanfrage VCI: Nachhaltige Flugkraftstoffe », sent by the German Chemical Industry Association – VCI, and addressed to Mr Walter Goetz, the Head of the Cabinet of the European Commissioner for Transport Adina-Ioana Vălean, dated 14, 18, 19 and 28 October 2021 with the reference number Ares(2021)6329164.

With regard to the documents listed above, we have come to the conclusion that they may be partially disclosed. A complete disclosure of the identified document is prevented by the exception concerning the protection of privacy and the integrity of the individual outlined in Article 4(1)(b) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001 regarding public access to European

Parliament, Council and Commission documents¹ (hereinafter ‘Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001’), because it contains the following personal data:

- the names and contact information of Commission staff members not pertaining to the senior management;
- the names and contact details of natural persons;
- other information relating to identifiable natural persons, in particular references to their functions, to the extent that these would enable their identification.

In your application, you indicate that your address is in United Kingdom. Transfers of personal data from the Commission to countries that are not members of the European Economic Area (EEA), or to international organisations are regulated under Chapter V of the Data Protection Regulation.

According to Article 47(1) of this Regulation, a transfer of personal data to a third country or an international organisation may take place where the Commission has decided that the third country, a territory or one or more specified sectors within that country, or the international organisation in question ensures an adequate level of protection and where the personal data are transferred solely to allow tasks within the competence of the controller to be carried out.

Based on the information available, the country of your residence is recognised by the Commission as ensuring an adequate level of protection. However, we would further like to inform you of the following.

Pursuant to Article 4(1)(b) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, access to a document has to be refused if its disclosure would undermine the protection of privacy and the integrity of the individual, in particular in accordance with European Union legislation regarding the protection of personal data.

The applicable legislation in this field is Regulation (EU) 2018/1725 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 October 2018 on the protection of natural persons with regard to the processing of personal data by the Union institutions, bodies, offices and agencies and on the free movement of such data, and repealing Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 and Decision No 1247/2002/EC² (hereinafter ‘Regulation (EU) 2018/1725’, or ‘Data Protection Regulation’).

In particular, Article 3(1) of Regulation (EU) 2018/1725 provides that personal data ‘means any information relating to an identified or identifiable natural person [...]’. The Court of Justice has specified that any information, which by reason of its content, purpose or effect, is linked to a particular person is to be considered as personal data³. In its judgment in Case C-28/08 P (Bavarian Lager)⁴, the Court of Justice ruled that when a

¹ OJ L 145, 31.5.2001, p. 43.

² Regulation (EU) 2018/1725 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 October 2018 on the protection of natural persons with regard to the processing of personal data by the Union institutions, bodies, offices and agencies and on the free movement of such data, and repealing Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 and Decision No 1247/2002/EC (OC L 205 of 21.11.2018, p. 39).

³ Judgment of the Court of Justice of the European Union of 20 December 2017 in Case C-434/16, *Peter Nowak v Data Protection Commissioner*, ECLI:EU:C:2017:994, paragraphs 33-35.

⁴ Judgment of 29 June 2010 in Case C-28/08 P, *Commission v Bavarian Lager*, ECLI:EU:C:2010:378, paragraph 63.

request is made for access to documents containing personal data, the Data Protection Regulation becomes fully applicable⁵.

Pursuant to Article 9(1)(b) of the Data Protection Regulation, personal data shall only be transmitted to recipients established in the Union other than Union institutions and bodies if “[t]he recipient establishes that it is necessary to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest and the controller, where there is any reason to assume that the data subject’s legitimate interests might be prejudiced, establishes that it is proportionate to transmit the personal data for that specific purpose after having demonstrably weighed the various competing interests”.

Only if these conditions are fulfilled and the processing constitutes lawful handling, in accordance with the requirements of Article 5 of Regulation (EU) 2018/1725, can the transmission of personal data occur.

According to Article 9(1)(b) of the Regulation (EU) 2018/1725, the European Commission has to examine the further conditions for a lawful processing of personal data only if the first condition is fulfilled, namely if the recipient has established that it is necessary to have the data transmitted to you for a specific purpose in the public interest. It is only in that case the European Commission has to examine whether there is a reason to assume that the legitimate interests of the data subject might be prejudiced and, in the affirmative, establish the proportionality of the transmission of the personal data for that specific purpose after having demonstrably weighed the various competing interests.

In your request, you do not express any particular interest to have access to these personal data nor do you put forward any arguments to establish the necessity to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest. Therefore, the European Commission does not have to examine whether there is a reason to assume that the data subject’s legitimate interests might be prejudiced.

Notwithstanding the above, please note that there are reasons to assume that the legitimate interests of the data subjects concerned would be prejudiced by disclosure of the personal data reflected in the documents, as there is a real and non-hypothetical risk that such public disclosure would harm their privacy and subject them to unsolicited external contacts.

Consequently, I conclude that, pursuant to Article 4(1)(b) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, access cannot be granted to the personal data contained in the requested document, as the need to obtain access thereto for a purpose in the public interest has not been substantiated and there is no reason to think that the legitimate interests of the individuals concerned would not be prejudiced by disclosure of the personal data concerned.

Please note that documents originating from third parties are disclosed to you based on Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001. However, this disclosure is without prejudice to the rules on intellectual property, which may limit your right to reproduce or exploit the released document without the agreement of the originator, who may hold an intellectual property right on them. The European Commission does not assume any responsibility from their reuse.

⁵ Whereas this judgment specifically related to Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 December 2000 on the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data by the Community institutions and bodies and on the free movement of such data, the principles set out therein are also applicable under the new data protection regime established by Regulation (EU) 2018/1725.

In accordance with Article 7(2) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, you are entitled to submit a confirmatory application requesting the Commission to review this position.

Such a confirmatory application should be addressed within 15 working days upon receipt of this letter to the Secretariat-General of the Commission at the following address:

European Commission
Secretariat-General
Unit C.1. 'Transparency, Document Management and Access to Documents'
BERL 7/076
B-1049 Brussels,

or by email to: sg-acc-doc@ec.europa.eu

Finally, we kindly ask you to acknowledge receipt of this reply.

Yours faithfully,

Flor DIAZ PULIDO
Head of Unit