

International Scientists and Economists Statement on Biofuels and Land Use

A letter to the European Commission

As scientists and economists involved in the field of climate, energy, and land use, we are writing to you to recommend that policies recognize and account for indirect land use change as a part of the lifecycle analyses of greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions from biofuels. This will encourage development of sustainable, low-carbon fuels that avoid conflict with food production and minimize harmful environmental impacts.

Our comments are relevant to your deliberations on indirect land use change emissions in the context of the Renewable Energy and Fuel Quality Directives. For policies like these to successfully reduce GHG emissions, it is critical to include all major sources of emissions, including those associated with changes in land use.

Peer-reviewed research over the last several years, including studies commissioned by the European Commission, indicates that conventional biofuels can directly or indirectly result in substantial GHG emissions through the conversion of forests and grasslands to croplands or pasture to accommodate biofuel production. Increased demand for crops to make fuel results in higher global commodity prices that can induce farmers in other countries to plow up new ground, including sensitive, high-carbon ecosystems such as tropical forests in South America and Southeast Asia or peatland in Southeast Asia. The conditions for this to occur are not relegated to the future, but are already in place. The Directives do not currently account for these emissions in their lifecycle analysis or elsewhere, giving biofuels credit for greater carbon savings than actually achieved.

There are uncertainties inherent in estimating the magnitude of indirect land use emissions from biofuels, but a policy that implicitly or explicitly assigns a value of zero is clearly not supported by the science. All the studies of land use change indicate that the emissions related to biofuels expansion are significant and can be quite large. Exhaust pipe emissions for biofuels are, by convention, ignored in performing lifecycle GHG emissions analysis for biofuels. This accounting convention is flawed, as was described in the opinion of the European Environment Agency Scientific Committee on 15 September 2011.¹ To justify the omission of exhaust pipe emissions, it is essential to account for changes in land use.

The current scientific understanding is sufficient to warrant immediate action, as has already been recognized in the U.S. federal Renewable Fuel Standard and California Low Carbon Fuels Standard. A regulation based on a robust framework of science can be adjusted as the analysis matures.

¹ <http://www.eea.europa.eu/about-us/governance/scientific-committee/sc-opinions/opinions-on-scientific-issues/sc-opinion-on-greenhouse-gas>

Without addressing land use change, the European Union's target for renewable energy in transport may fail to deliver genuine carbon savings in the real world. It could end up as merely an exercise on paper that promotes widespread deforestation and higher food prices.

It has been suggested that higher GHG thresholds for direct emissions are an adequate substitute for accounting for indirect land use change emissions. However, a problem in the accounting cannot be fixed by changing the threshold. A complete accounting is essential to assuring that promised carbon reductions are credible. Flawed accounting could even encourage greater expansion of biofuels that cause damaging changes in land use, as described in the September 15 EEA Scientific Committee opinion.

Biofuels policies should encourage a growing clean energy market and create jobs producing low carbon biofuels that avoid land use change. Strategic investment decisions must be based upon the best available assessments of the GHG emissions of alternative fuel pathways. Promptly establishing a credible framework that includes indirect land use change will signal the market to invest in biofuels that minimize deforestation and competition with food.

The president of the commission has pledged "a fundamental review of the way EU institutions access and use scientific advice."² We urge you to align the EU biofuels policy with the best scientific knowledge and take into account emissions from indirect changes in land use.

²<http://europa.eu/rapid/pressReleasesAction.do?reference=SPEECH/09/391&format=HTML&aged=0&language=EN&guiLanguage=en>

Sincerely,

██████████
Chief Technical Specialist for Renewable Energy
and Energy Efficiency
World Bank
Washington, DC United States

██████████
Doris Duke Professor of Conservation Ecology
Duke University
Durham, NC United States
Dr. A. H. Heineken Prize for Environmental Sciences
Tyler Prize for Environmental Achievement

██████████
Professor
Alpen-Adria Universität Klagenfurt
Vienna, Austria

██████████
Professor Emeritus
Stanford University
Stanford, CA United States
Nobel Memorial Prize in Economic Science,
U.S. National Medal of Science Member,
U.S. National Academy of Sciences

██████████
Director of ISRIC
World Soil Information (ISRIC)
Wageningen, Netherlands

██████████
Full Professor
University of Antwerp
Antwerp, Belgium

██████████
Director of Science and Policy
Union of Concerned Scientists
Cambridge, MA United States
Lead author, 4th Assessment Report of the IPCC
Lead author, IPCC Special Report on Land Use,
Land-use Change and Forestry

██████████
Director, Harvard Forest
Harvard University
Petersham, MA United States

██████████
Donald C. Waite III Professor of Social Enterprise
Columbia University
New York, NY United States
Past President, Association of Environmental and
Resource Economists Chairman of the Board and
Co-Founder, Coalition for Rainforest Nations

██████████
Norwegian University of Life Sciences
Aas, Norway
Past President, European Association of
Agricultural Economists

██████████
Biodiversity Chair
The H. John Heinz III Center for Science,
Economics and the Environment
Washington, DC United States
Tyler Prize for Environmental Achievement

██████████
President
Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies
Millbrook, NY United States
Past President, Ecological Society of America
Member, The National Academy of Sciences

██████████
Distinguished Research Professor
James Cook University
Smithfield, Australia

██████████
Senior Lecturer
The University of Sydney
Sydney, Australia

██████████
Institute of Social Ecology, Alpen-Adria
Universitaet Klagenfurt
Vienna, Austria

██████████
Head of Emission Trading Unit
Umweltbundesamt
Vienna, Austria

██████████
University of Vienna
Vienna, Austria

██████████
Institute of Social Ecology, Alpen-Adria
Universitaet Klagenfurt
Vienna, Austria

██████████
University of Natural Resources & Life Science
Vienna, Austria

██████████
Université Catholique de Louvain
Louvain-La-Neuve, Belgium

██████████
University of Antwerp
Antwerp, Belgium

██████████
Professor
University of Antwerp
Antwerpen, Belgium

[REDACTED]
Research Associate
Université Libre de Bruxelles
Brussels, Belgium

[REDACTED]
Research Coordinator
University of Helsinki
Helsinki, Finland

[REDACTED]
Université Libre de Bruxelles
Brussels, Belgium

[REDACTED]
Researcher
University of Helsinki
Vantaa, Finland

[REDACTED]
University of Antwerp
Wilrijk, Belgium

[REDACTED]
University of Jyväskylä
Jyväskylä, Finland

[REDACTED]
Professor
Institute of Plant Physiology & Genetics, Bulgarian
Academy of Sciences
Sofia, Bulgaria

[REDACTED]
Adjunct Professor
University of Turku
Turku, Finland

[REDACTED]
Krzyzanowski Consulting, University of British
Columbia
Stirling-Rawdon, ON Canada

[REDACTED]
Senior Scientist
VTT Technical Research Centre of Finland
Espoo, Finland

[REDACTED]
Head of Center, Bioenergy
Aalborg University
Ribe, Denmark

[REDACTED]
VTT Technical Research Centre of Finland
Espoo, Finland

[REDACTED]
Professor
Aarhus University
Aarhus, Denmark

[REDACTED]
Researcher
National Center for Scientific Research (CNRS)
Paris, France

[REDACTED]
Scientific Assistant
Roskilde University
Hvalsoe, Denmark

[REDACTED]
Researcher
Agricultural Research for Development (CIRAD)
Montpellier, France

[REDACTED]
National Institute for Agricultural Research
(INRA)
Avignon, France

[REDACTED]
Researcher and Lecturer
University of Kaiserslautern
Kaiserslautern, Germany

[REDACTED]
Georg-August-Universität Göttingen
Göttingen, Germany

[REDACTED]
Professor of Chemistry
University of Regensburg
Regensburg, Germany

[REDACTED]
Senior Scientist
Institute for Energy and Environmental Research
Heidelberg (IFEU)
Heidelberg, Germany

[REDACTED]
Professor
University Oldenburg
Oldenburg, Germany

[REDACTED]
Senior Scientist
JLU Giessen
Giessen, Germany

[REDACTED]
Lohne, Germany

[REDACTED]
Kiel University
Flintbek, Germany

[REDACTED]
Berlin-Brandenburg Academy of Sciences
Berlin, Germany

[REDACTED]
Professor
Ludwig-Maximilians-University Munich
Munich, Germany

[REDACTED]
CAU Kiel
Kiel, Germany

[REDACTED]
Phyletisches Museum
Jena, Germany

[REDACTED]
Professor of Chemical technology
Flensburg University of Applied Sciences
Flensburg, Germany

[REDACTED]
Rainforest Institute
Freiburg, Germany

[REDACTED]
Institute for Energy and Environmental Research
Heidelberg (IFEU)
Heidelberg, Germany

[REDACTED]
Scientific Assistant
University of Giessen
Giessen, Germany

[REDACTED]
Scientific Director
Institute for Energy and Environmental Research
Heidelberg (IFEU)
Heidelberg, Germany

[REDACTED]
Karlsruhe Institute of Technology
Garmisch-Partenkirchen, Germany

[REDACTED]
Lawrence Berkeley National Lab, JBEI
Berlin, Germany

[REDACTED]
Rainforest Institute
Freiburg, Germany

[REDACTED]
Sustainability Strategies and Innovation
SD Innovation
Frankfurt, Germany

[REDACTED]
State Museum of Natural History, Stuttgart
Stuttgart, Germany

[REDACTED]
Universität Gießen
Giessen, Germany

[REDACTED]
Postdoc Researcher
University of Gießen
Wettenberg, Germany

[REDACTED]
University of Goettingen
Goettingen, Germany

[REDACTED]
Research Scientist
University of Oldenburg
Oldenburg, Germany

[REDACTED]
University of Ulm
Ulm, Germany

[REDACTED]
Professor
Institute for Social and Economic Change
Bangalore, India

[REDACTED]
Senior Scientist
Nature Conservation Foundation
Valparai, India

[REDACTED]
Professor
Indian Statistical Institute
New Delhi, India

[REDACTED]
International Center for Research in Agroforestry
(ICRAF)
Nairobi, Kenya

[REDACTED]
Universidad de Tabasco
Villahermosa, Mexico

[REDACTED]
Professor
VU University Amsterdam
Amsterdam, Netherlands

[REDACTED]
Senior Adviser
Deltares
Delft, Netherlands

Researcher
Foundation Bargerveen
Nijmegen, Netherlands

Professor
Groningen University
Groningen, Netherlands

Senior Researcher
Wageningen University and Research Centre
Delft, Netherlands

Senior Fellow
Motu Economic and Public Policy Research
Wellington, New Zealand

Climate Change Analyst
Wellington, New Zealand

Head of Department
National Isotope Centre - GNS Science
Lower Hutt, New Zealand

Universidad Autonoma Madrid
Madrid, Spain

Research Fellow
Academia Sinica
Taipei, Taiwan

Postdoctoral Researcher
Imperial College London
London, United Kingdom

University of Cambridge
Cambridge, United Kingdom

Research Fellow
University of Kent
London, United Kingdom

Butterfly Conservation
Dorchester, United Kingdom

Senior Scientist
United Nations Environmental Program - World
Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP - WCMC)
Cambridge, United Kingdom

University of Cambridge
Cambridge, United Kingdom

Royal Society research fellow
University of Leeds
London, United Kingdom

Head of Department
University of Leicester
Leicester, United Kingdom

Executive Director
Conservation Science Institute
Palmer, AK United States

Biologist
Southwestern Biological Institute
Tucson, AZ United States

University of Arizona
Tucson, AZ United States

Chemist
Hayward, CA United States

Research Fellow
California Academy of Sciences
San Rafael, CA United States

California Lutheran University
Thousand Oaks, CA United States

Professor Emeritus
California State University, East Bay
Hayward, CA United States

Professor Emeritus
California State University, Chico
Chico, CA United States

Environmental Science
San Francisco, CA United States

Professor of Sustainable Energy Resource
San Jose State University
San Jose, CA United States

Project Scientist
University of California, Berkeley
Berkeley, CA United States

Professor of Ecosystem Sciences
University of California, Berkeley
Berkeley, CA United States

Postdoctoral Fellow
University of California, Berkeley
El Cerrito, CA United States

Professor of Public Policy
University of California, Berkeley
Berkeley, CA United States

Assistant Research Engineer
University of California, Berkeley
Berkeley, CA United States

Postdoctoral Researcher
University of California, Berkeley
Oakland, CA United States

University of California, Davis
Davis, CA United States

Research Engineer
University of California, Davis
Davis, CA United States

Professor Emeritus of Economics
University of Colorado, Boulder
Boulder, CO United States

Professor
University of California, Los Angeles
Agoura Hills, CA United States

Professor Emeritus
University of Colorado, Boulder
Loveland, CO United States

University of California, Riverside
San Diego, CA United States

Professor
University of Connecticut
Storrs, CT United States

Researcher
University of California, Santa Cruz
Felton, CA United States

Senior Scientist
Union of Concerned Scientists
Washington, DC United States

Professor
University of California, Santa Cruz
Felton, CA United States

Agricultural Economist
Union of Concerned Scientists
Washington, DC United States

Professor (endowed chair)
University of Southern California
Topanga, CA United States

Biology
Seaford, DE United States

Research Geologist
Sebastopol, CA United States

Ecology
Jupiter, FL United States

Professor Emeritus
Colorado State University
Masonville, CO United States

President
The Corporation for Future Resources (CFR)
Tallahassee, FL United States

University of California, Davis
Boulder, CO United States

██████████
Professor
University of Florida
Gainesville, FL United States

██████████
University of Georgia
Watkinsville, GA United States

██████████
Principal Investigator
Black Ivory Biotech
Honolulu, HI United States

██████████
University of Hawaii
Honolulu, HI United States

██████████
Associate Professor
Central College
Pella, IA United States

██████████
Professor Emeritus
Iowa State University
Ames, IA United States

██████████
Associate Professor and Co-Chair
Augustana College
Rock Island, IL United States

██████████
Science Director
National Audubon Society
Wilmette, IL United States

██████████
Northwestern University
Evanston, IL United States

██████████
Richland Community College
Decatur, IL United States

██████████
Professor and Chair
Southern Illinois University
Carbondale, IL United States

██████████
Professor of Microbiology
University of Chicago
Chicago, IL United States

██████████
Postdoctoral researcher
University of Illinois
Urbana, IL United States

██████████
Visiting Research Assistant Professor
University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign
Urbana, IL United States

██████████
Visiting Research Scientist
University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign
Mahomet, IL United States

██████████
Professor of Biology
Indiana State University
Terre Haute, IN United States

██████████
President
Ad Astra Institute of Kansas
Lawrence, KS United States

McPherson College
McPherson, KS United States

Professor
Univeristy of Kentucky
Lexington, KY United States

Director
Center for Applied Regional Studies
Cambridge, MA United States

Professor Emeritus
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Weston, MA United States

Ecologist
Easthampton, MA United States

Professor Emiritus
Lenox, MA United States

Professor Emeritus
Amherst, MA United States

Biology
Port republic, MD United States

Postdoctoral Research Associate
Rocky Mountain Biological Laboratory
United States

Mitchell Family Professor of Economics, Emeritus
Colby College
Waterville, ME United States

Professor of Law, Professor of Environment
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, MI United States

Professor
University of Minnesota
St Paul, MN United States

University of Minnesota, Morris
Morris, MN United States

Distinguished Research Professor of Economics
University of Minnesota, Morris
Morris, MN United States

Michigan State University
Hickory Corners, MO United States

Associate Professor Emeritus of Atmospheric
Science
University of Missouri
Columbia, MO United States

President
The Conservation Agency
Jackson, MS United States

██████████
Professor Emeritus of Biology
Davidson College
Davidson, NC United States

██████████
Professor of Economics
Montclair State University
Montclair, NJ United States

██████████
Adjunct Professor
Duke University
Durham, NC United States

██████████
Associate Professor of Biology
Richard Stockton College
Northfield, NJ United States

██████████
Adjunct Professor
North Carolina State University
Chapel Hill, NC United States

██████████
Gila Regional Information Project
Silver City, NM United States

██████████
Research Environmental Engineer 3
RTI International
Chapel Hill, NC United States

██████████
Director
Global Change Consulting Consortium
Las Cruces, NM United States

██████████
Professor
University of North Carolina
Chapel Hill, NC United States

██████████
Senior Scientist
Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies
Red Hook, NY United States

██████████
Professor
University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill
Chapel Hill, NC United States

██████████
Professor
Cornell University
Ithaca, NY United States

██████████
Ecologist
United States Department of Agriculture,
Agricultural Research Service
Mandan, ND United States

██████████
Assistant Professor
Pratt Institute
Brooklyn, NY United States

██████████
Professor of Economics
University of Nebraska
Lincoln, NE United States

██████████
Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute
Troy, NY United States

██████████
Professor
Rutgers University
New York, NY United States

██████████
State University of New York, Oswego
Oswego, NY United States

██████████
Biology
Cincinnati, OH United States

██████████
Professor Emerita
Case Western Reserve University
Cleveland, OH United States

██████████
John Carroll University
Cleveland Heights, OH United States

██████████
Professor
Miami University
Oxford, OH United States

██████████
Ohio State University
Columbus, OH United States

██████████
University of Akron
Akron, OH United States

██████████
University of Toledo
Toledo, OH United States

██████████
Biology
Brookings, OR United States

██████████
Oregon State University
Corvallis, OR United States

██████████
Professor Emeritus
Oregon State University
Corvallis, OR United States

██████████
Professor
University of Oregon
Eugene, OR United States

██████████
Salem, OR United States

██████████
Ashland, OR United States

██████████
Associate Professor
Temple University
Ambler, PA United States

██████████
Senior Conservation Scientist
The Nature Conservancy
Williamsport, PA United States

██████████
Professor of Chemistry
University of Pennsylvania
Swarthmore, PA United States

Assistant Professor
Florida International University
Providence, RI United States

Professor
Vanderbilt University
Nashville, TN United States

Wildlife Biologist
Millington, TN United States

Professor of Biology
Lone Star College, Kingwood
Kingwood, TX United States

Assistant Professor
Texas A&M University
College Station, TX United States

Associate Professor
University of Texas, Austin
Austin, TX United States

Distinguished Professor of Biology
University of Utah
Salt Lake City, UT United States

Professor Environmental Science Public
George Mason University
Fairfax Station, VA United States

University Distinguished Professor of
Environment
Virginia Tech
Blacksburg, VA United States

Conservation Biologist
Front Royal, VA United States

Middlebury College
Cornwall, VT United States

Biology
Eastsound, WA United States

Biology
Ritzville, WA United States

University of Wisconsin, Madison
Bow, WA United States

Wenatchee Valley College
Wenatchee, WA United States

University of Wisconsin
Milwaukee, WI United States

Research Associate
University of Wisconsin, Madison
Madison, WI United States

[REDACTED]
Associate Dean for Research
University of Wisconsin, Madison
Madison, WI United States

[REDACTED]
Professor
University of Wyoming
Laramie, WY United States

Signers as of December 1, 2011.