



EUROPEAN COMMISSION  
DIRECTORATE-GENERAL FOR MOBILITY AND TRANSPORT

Directorate B - Investment, Innovative & Sustainable Transport  
B.4 - Sustainable & Intelligent Transport

Ref. Ares(2019)2804283 - 25/04/2019

Brussels, **25 AVR. 2019**

Belen BALANYA  
Corporate Europe Observatory  
Rue d'Edimbourg 26  
1050 Brussels  
Belgium

Advance copy by email :  
ask+request-6749-774a9902@asktheeu.org

**Subject: Your application for access to documents – Ref GestDem No  
GESTDEM/2019/2069**

Dear Ms Balanya,

We refer to your e-mail dated 01/04/2019, in which you make a request for access to documents, registered on 03/04/2019 under the above mentioned reference number.

You requested access to documents containing the following information:

1- all correspondence (including email) between 1st April 2017 and 31st March 2019 between the Commissioner for Transport and/or her cabinet and/or officials and representatives of DG MOVE on one hand and representatives from ExxonMobil, FuelsEurope and/or the International Association of Oil & Gas Producers (IOGP) on the other, in which one or more of the following issues were addressed:

- the Gas winter package;
- the gas market design;
- the last review of the Renewable Energy Directive
- and the review of the 2030 climate and energy targets.

2 - list of meetings between 1st April 2017 and 31st March 2019 between officials and representatives of DG MOVE on one hand and representatives from ExxonMobil, FuelsEurope and/or the International Association of Oil & Gas Producers (IOGP) on the other, in which one or more of the following issues were addressed:

- the Gas winter package;
- the gas market design;
- the last review of the Renewable Energy Directive
- and the review of the 2030 climate and energy targets.

3 - minutes of the meetings mentioned above

I would like to inform that only document in DG MOVE's register exists and this contains the minutes of a meeting between DG MOVE and ExxonMobil held on 12/06/2018. The meeting was not directly linked to your request but it concerns the different fuel options to reduce GHG emissions from Transport. It is for this reason that we disclosing this document to you.

Please find enclosed copy of the document. Some parts of the document have been blanked out as their disclosure is prevented by exceptions to the right of access laid down in Article 4 of this Regulation.

The redacted parts of the documents contain personal data, in particular the personal details of European Institution staff.

Pursuant to Article 4(1)(b) of the Regulation, access to a document has to be refused if its disclosure would undermine the protection of privacy and the integrity of the individual, in particular in accordance with European Union legislation regarding the protection of personal data.

The applicable legislation in this field is Regulation (EU) 2018/1725 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 October 2018 on the protection of natural persons with regard to the processing of personal data by the Union institutions, bodies, offices and agencies and on the free movement of such data, and repealing Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 and Decision No 1247/2002/EC<sup>1</sup> ('Regulation 2018/1725').

Indeed, Article 3(1) of Regulation 2018/1725 provides that personal data 'means any information relating to an identified or identifiable natural person [...]'. The Court of Justice has specified that any information, which by reason of its content, purpose or effect, is linked to a particular person is to be considered as personal data.<sup>2</sup> Please note in this respect that the names, signatures, functions, telephone numbers and/or initials pertaining to staff members of an institution are to be considered personal data.<sup>3</sup>

In its judgment in Case C-28/08 P (*Bavarian Lager*)<sup>4</sup>, the Court of Justice ruled that when a request is made for access to documents containing personal data, the Data Protection Regulation becomes fully applicable<sup>5</sup>.

Pursuant to Article 9(1)(b) of Regulation 2018/1725, 'personal data shall only be transmitted to recipients established in the Union other than Union institutions and bodies if

---

<sup>1</sup> Official Journal L 205 of 21.11.2018, p. 39.

<sup>2</sup> Judgment of the Court of Justice of the European Union of 20 December 2017 in Case C-434/16, *Peter Nowak v Data Protection Commissioner*, request for a preliminary ruling, paragraphs 33-35, ECLI:EU:C:2017:994.

<sup>3</sup> Judgment of the General Court of 19 September 2018 in case T-39/17, *Port de Brest v Commission*, paragraphs 43-44, ECLI:EU:T:2018:560.

<sup>4</sup> Judgment of 29 June 2010 in Case C-28/08 P, *European Commission v The Bavarian Lager Co. Ltd*, EU:C:2010:378, paragraph 59.

<sup>5</sup> Whereas this judgment specifically related to Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 December 2000 on the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data by the Community institutions and bodies and on the free movement of such data, the principles set out therein are also applicable under the new data protection regime established by Regulation 2018/1725.

‘[t]he recipient establishes that it is necessary to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest and the controller, where there is any reason to assume that the data subject’s legitimate interests might be prejudiced, establishes that it is proportionate to transmit the personal data for that specific purpose after having demonstrably weighed the various competing interests’.

Only if these conditions are fulfilled and the processing constitutes lawful processing in accordance with the requirements of Article 5 of Regulation 2018/1725, can the transmission of personal data occur.

According to Article 9(1)(b) of Regulation 2018/1725, the European Commission has to examine the further conditions for a lawful processing of personal data only if the first condition is fulfilled, namely if the recipient has established that it is necessary to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest. It is only in this case that the European Commission has to examine whether there is a reason to assume that the data subject’s legitimate interests might be prejudiced and, in the affirmative, establish the proportionality of the transmission of the personal data for that specific purpose after having demonstrably weighed the various competing interests.

In your request, you do not put forward any arguments to establish the necessity to have the data transmitted for a specific purpose in the public interest. Therefore, the European Commission does not have to examine whether there is a reason to assume that the data subject’s legitimate interests might be prejudiced.

Notwithstanding the above, please note that there are reasons to assume that the legitimate interests of the data subjects concerned would be prejudiced by disclosure of the personal data reflected in the documents, as there is a real and non-hypothetical risk that eg: such public disclosure would harm their privacy and subject them to unsolicited external contacts.

Consequently, I conclude that, pursuant to Article 4(1)(b) of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001, access cannot be granted to the personal data, as the need to obtain access thereto for a purpose in the public interest has not been substantiated and there is no reason to think that the legitimate interests of the individuals concerned would not be prejudiced by disclosure of the personal data concerned.

In case you would disagree with the assessment that the redacted data are personal data which can only be disclosed if such disclosure is legitimate under the applicable rules on the protection of personal data, you are entitled, in accordance with Article 7(2) of Regulation 1049/2001, to make a confirmatory application requesting the Commission to review this position.

Such a confirmatory application should be addressed within 15 working days upon receipt of this letter to the Secretary-General of the Commission at the following address:

European Commission  
Secretary-General  
Transparency unit SG-B-4  
BERL 5/288  
B-1049 Bruxelles

or by email to: [sg-acc-doc@ec.europa.eu](mailto:sg-acc-doc@ec.europa.eu) .

Yours sincerely,



Claire DEPRE  
Head of Unit

Enclosure:                   ARES(2018)3093739 – Minutes of the meeting between DG MOVE  
and ExxonMobil held on 12/06/2018